

Research on the Impact of 2010 Crackdown on Sex Work and HIV Interventions in China

2010年严打对性工作与 艾滋病防治影响研究



China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum
中国性工作者机构网络平台
2011年1月



|中国性工作者机构网络平台|

China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum

China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum

Research on the Impact of 2010 Crackdown on Sex Work and HIV Interventions in China

2010 年严打对性工作与艾滋病防治影响研究



|中国性工作者机构网络平台|

China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum

China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum

January 2011



1. Background.....	5
2. Research Objectives.....	5
3. Research Methodology	6
3.1 Quantitative Questionnaires	6
3.2 Qualitative Interviews	7
3.3 Research Limitations	7
4. Basic Data of the Respondents	8
4.1 Basic Data of the Respondents	8
4.1.1 Basic Data of Questionnaire Respondents	8
4.1.2 Basic Data of the Interview Respondents	11
4.2. Respondents Experience of Crackdowns by Public Security before 2010	11
4.2.1 Questionnaire Respondents Experience	11
4.2.2 Stories of Crackdown Experiences	13
5. Characteristics of Crackdowns in 2020	13
5.1 Wide-Range, Long-Lasting and Intensive	13
Table 5.1: Details of crackdowns in 2010.....	13
5.2 Many EEs Shut Down, Clients and Earnings Decreased.....	15
5.3 Regional Characteristics and Differences in the Crackdowns	17
5.4 More Severe Punishment and Violence in Law Enforcement	20
5.5 Policy at the Top, Strategies on the Ground	23
6. Influence of the Anti-Pornography Campaign on Sex Work and HIV/AIDS Prevention	25
6.1 Professional Security is still Sex Workers Major Concern.....	25
6.2 Little Change in Bringing and Using Condoms, but Some Reduction	26
6.3 The Effects of Crackdown on HIV/AIDS Prevention and Intervention	27
6.3.1 Community Grassroots Organizations and Peer Educators.....	27
6.3.2 Sex Workers	28
7. Findings and Recommendations	29



7.1	Main Findings	29
7.1.1	The crackdowns resulted in decrease of sex workers, changed operation patterns of EEs and more obscure work place of sex workers	29
7.1.2	Sex workers were afraid that carrying and using condoms could become evidence of prostitution in the anti-pornography campaign	29
7.1.3	Crackdowns have increased the vulnerability of sex workers	29
7.1.4	Crackdowns have disclosed the illegal behaviours in law enforcement of the police	30
7.2	Multiple Views on Crackdowns from Sex Workers and Stakeholders	30
7.2.1	The View of Sex Workers.....	30
7.2.2	The View of EE owners and managers	30
7.3	Comments and Suggestions from Sex Workers and Stakeholders.....	31
7.3.1	Suggestions from Sex Workers.....	31
7.3.2	Suggestions from Community-based Sex Workers Service Organizations	32
8	Acknowledgements.....	33

Glossary

Anti-pornography campaigns 扫黄

Strict crackdown 严打

Sex worker (SW) 性工作者

China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum (CSWONF) 中国性工作者机构网络平台

Female sex worker (FSW) 女性性工作者

Money boy (MB) 男性性工作者

Transgender (TG) sex worker 易装/变性性工作者

Entertainment establishments(EEs) 娱乐场所

Owners of EEs 娱乐场所业主

Zero-Tolerance 零容忍

Outreach 外展

Condom promotion and utilization 安全套推广与使用

HIV 艾滋病病毒

STI 性传播疾病（性病）

AIDS 获得性免疫功能丧失综合症（艾滋病）

UNFPA 联合国人口基金

NCAIDS 国家性病艾滋病预防控制中心

CDC 疾病预防控制中心

Non-governmental organization (NGO) 非政府组织

Sex and reproductive health (SRH) 性和生殖健康

1. Background

It is well known that unprotected sex is a major cause of HIV infection. Sexual transmission is already the leading cause of HIV infection in China. A reported 59 percent of people who are living with HIV/AIDS in 2009 were infected by unsafe sex. Sex workers and their customers are one of the populations with a high infection risk, so the promotion of condom use among sex workers is an important strategy of HIV interventions.

However, crackdowns on sex work have always been a favored strategy of authorities as a way of decreasing the demand. On April 11, 2010, the Beijing Public Security Bureau formed a Prohibition Office on Sex Work, Gambling and Drugs. On the evening of May 11, the Beijing Public Security Bureau initiated a zero-tolerance inspection on four top-rated EEs, including "Tian Shang Ren Jian" (Passion Club). Via video phone conferences, public security departments around the country participated in the 2010 Strict Crackdown Special Initiative on June 13th and Public Security System Renovation Initiative on June 22nd, taking assignments to conduct crackdowns against sex work, gambling and drug using, especially against illegal activities such as prostitution and obscene performances. After that, the crackdowns on sex work started in Beijing and quickly spread all over the nation.

In April 2010, such continual, cooperative, and intensive dragnet crackdowns with multi-level police involvement (including public security, criminal investigation, policeman and special forces, etc.) were not common. How these crackdowns that do not end sex work yet impacts the industry and condom use promotion in EEs is thus far, unknown.

As the leading organization addressing HIV/AIDS and sex work in United Nations, UNFPA has funded NCAIDS and CSWONF separately to conduct research to understand how local stakeholders, including sex workers, owners of EEs and sex worker service organizations, see the impacts of these crackdowns and their effects on HIV intervention; this is what ultimately matters to the formulation of HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment plans in the long-run.

China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum (CSWONF) was founded in 2009; it is a civil organization forum initiated by community-based organizations which provide occupational health and safety intervention for sex workers in China. The mission of CSWONF is to support the development of its members, to improve the occupational health environment of sex workers so that sex workers can live and work in an environment free from discrimination with equal right to development. The Forum consists of 14 organizations with its Secretariat based in Shanghai Leyi (now renamed Shanghai Xinsheng).

2. Research Objectives

The research conducted by CSWONF is to collect data from strict crackdowns and crackdowns on sex work in 2010 in the regions where the forum members work, to understand the impact of crackdowns on local sex

workers and HIV interventions, and to provide recommendations and suggestions generated from local level to decision makers. Specifically,

- 1) Collect first-hand materials in relation to the crackdowns on sex work in 2010 in the regions where CSWONF members work in order to analyze the direct or indirect impacts of these crackdowns on local sex workers and HIV interventions.
- 2) Learn the perspectives of EE owners and the measures they take to counter the crackdown in 2010.
- 3) Learn how sex worker service organizations see the crackdowns and their suggestions on how to conduct HIV prevention among sex workers in light of the crackdowns.

This research will present findings on how crackdowns on sex work will affect sex workers and HIV prevention from their perspective, and try to evaluate what countermeasures the governments and sex worker service organizations will take under these circumstances.

3. Research Methodology

Combining quantitative with qualitative methods, it took two and a half months for the 14 member organizations of CSWONF to conduct research in 12 cities. Under the general coordination by the CSWONF Secretariat, experts on sex workers and HIV prevention were involved in designing the questionnaires and interview outlines, which also were reviewed by UNFPA, UNAIDS and some CSWONF member organizations for feedback.

Since the participation and subject matter of NGOs were important in the research, all interviews and questionnaires were conducted by the staff of CSWONF members. On-site guidance was provided by experts in Tianjin, Qingdao, Jiaozhou and Guangzhou, and any issues identified were presented to all CSWONF members for improving data quality in other sites.

In a word, this was the first comprehensively large-scale research targeting sex workers conducted by non-researchers and non-health professionals in China. The respondents' particularity were taken into consideration as well, and informed consent from each respondent was obtained in all questionnaires and interview sessions.

3.1 Quantitative Questionnaires

A total of 299 valid questionnaires were finally collected by 14 CSWONF members, from 12 cities including Beijing (BJ), Kunming (KM), Gejiu (GJ), Shenyang (SY), Tianjin (TJ), Guangzhou (GZ), Wuhan (WH), Shanghai (SH), Jiangyou (JY), Qingdao (QD), Jiaozhou (JZ), and Ruili (RL). The respondents covered high-end to middle-end female sex workers, streetwalkers, money boys and transgender sex workers (please refer to table 4.1 gender and workplace data of questionnaire respondents). All questionnaires were filled in by sex workers themselves under CSWONF members' guidance, and were uploaded onto CSWONF's website. Statistic analysis of the data was run with EXCEL.

3.2 Qualitative Interviews

Individual interview sessions constitute the qualitative methodology in the study, complementing the microscopic trends identified from quantitative methods, helping to keep the researchers insightful.

In this research, each CSWONF member was required to conduct five in-depth interviews with sex workers at different levels of EEs, including streetwalkers (including male, female and transgender), owners of EEs and peer educators. The final number of qualitative interviews collected were 69 cases, although the original target was 70. Among all the interview respondents, 43 were female, including 17 owners of EEs, 20 sex workers in EEs and 6 streetwalkers, and 20 were males, including 7 owners of EEs, 10 sex workers in EEs, 1 in rental house and 1 mistress. The other 6 were transgender males, including 1 owner of EE and 5 in rental houses (please refer to table 4.3 for gender and workplace data of interview respondents). All qualitative interview data was sorted out by respective CSWONF members and were uploaded onto CSWONF's website.

3.3 Research Limitations

It is worth mentioning a few characteristics of this particular research before we present the main findings.

- 1) Subject matter: The research was conducted by community-based organizations (CBOs) in different regions under the coordination of CSWONF; data collected were first-handed materials, and differed from other research in the public health and social science fields.
- 2) Validity: The data collected was relatively more reliable since the research was carried out by community organizations that provide services to sex workers and the respondents were more likely to trust the investigators.
- 3) Diversity of sample size: The respondents covered female, male and transgender sex workers, owners of EEs and peer educators, thus was more likely to get an overall picture of the sex industry in light of the crackdowns.
- 4) Comprehensiveness: The research was conducted in 12 cities, including municipalities, provincial capital cities, and prefecture-level cities, that all had extensive crackdowns.
- 5) Gender-oriented analysis: 40% of the respondents in the study were money boys. This was the first comprehensive analysis between female and male sex workers.

However, we also faced some limitations in the study, which were as follows:

- 1) The data collected was still unable to present a complete picture of the crackdowns on sex work because CSWONF members involved might only work in certain regions or in familiar communities and contexts.
- 2) The research capacity that some community organizations demonstrated in conducting the research was insufficient. There were inconsistencies in the questionnaires collected, and important information were missing in some of the interviews. All these will affect the quality of data analysis and the research report.

- 3) Due to time and fund limitations, we did not give research training to CSWONF members participating; however, this was the first study of this type for many of them, and that will affect the data quality in some way.

Nonetheless, such a grassroots and community based study was important and valuable. Further data sharing and comparisons with the CDC will help to understand how the crackdowns on sex work and on illegal activities will affect the sex work industry and HIV prevention.

4. Basic Data of the Respondents

4.1 Basic Data of the Respondents

4.1.1 Basic Data of Questionnaire Respondents

From the 299 questionnaires collected, 105¹ respondents were male (35.12%) and 194² were female (64.88%). From the 296 answers to the question "what type of a place do you work," 32.45% (61/188) of female sex workers were more likely to work at a hair salon or foot massage house, while 21.73% (51/188) were streetwalkers or worked at a rental house. Most money boys, 70.1% (68/97), worked at a club, while 72.72% (8/11) of transgender sex workers were streetwalkers or worked at a rental house.

4.1 Gender and Workplace Data of Questionnaire Respondents

Workplace	Gender	China Sex Worker Organization Network Forum			Total
		Female	Male	Transgender	
High-end EEs	Starred Hotels	9	-	-	9
	Clubs	4	68	2	74
	Night Clubs	31	3	-	34
Middle-end to low-end EEs	Bars	5	2	1	8
	Bath Houses	13	7	-	20
	Hair Salon/Foot Massage Houses	61	1	-	62

¹ including money boys and transgender sex workers

² including transgender respondents since some transgender respondents identified themselves as female



Rental Houses	25	10	4	39
Wayside Houses	9	-	-	9
Streetwalkers	26	4	4	34
Others	5	2	-	7
Total	188	97	11	296

The age and education level of the respondents showed an evident spindle shape. Among the 297 respondents that provided their age, 59.87% (179) of them were between 20 to 29 years, the youngest was 16 years old and the oldest was 61 years of age (please refer to table 4.2.1).

Among the 299 questionnaire respondents, 50 (16.72%) were illiterate or primary school graduates, 137 (45.82%) were junior high graduates, and senior high and junior college graduated counted for 112 (37.46%). The education level of money boys was competitively higher than female sex workers; the rate of senior high school and above among money boys was 69.07% (67 among 97), whereas the rate for female sex workers were only 20.94% (40 among 188) (please refer to table 4.2.2).

4.2-1 Age and Gender Data of Questionnaire Respondents

Age Group	No. of Males	Percentage of Males	No. of Females	Percentage of Females
50 and above	0	0.00%	8	2.68%
45-50	0	0.00%	7	2.34%
40-44	0	0.00%	17	5.69%
35-39	0	0.00%	29	9.70%
30-34	5	1.67%	43	14.38%
25-29	38	12.71%	42	14.05%
20-24	60	20.07%	39	13.04%
20 and under	5	1.67%	6	2.01%
Total	108	36.12%	191	63.88%

4.2-2 Education Level of Questionnaire Respondents



Education Level	Male	Female	Transgender	Sub-Total	Percentage
Illiterates	1	10	-	11	3.68%
Primary School	2	37	-	39	13.04%
Junior High	27	104	6	137	45.82%
Senior High or Junior College	49	36	3	88	29.43%
College and above	18	4	2	24	8.03%
Total	97	191	11	299	100%

4.2.3 Workplace and City Data of Questionnaire Respondents

Work place	BJ	TJ	SH	QD	JZ	SY	GZ	WH	KM	GJ	RL	JY	Total	
High-end EEs	Starred Hotels			1	1			1		4		2	9	
	Clubs	33	14	10		7			7	1		2	74	
	Night Clubs	19			10	2	3						34	
Middle-end EEs	Bars		1		1	2	1		1	2			8	
	Hair Salon/ Foot Massage Houses		6		1	7		11	16	4	1	10	7	63
	Bath Houses		16		1		2					1	20	
	Wayside Houses						5		1	2		1	9	
Low-end EEs	Rental Houses	6	2	6	1	1	1	3	3	6	4	6	39	
	Streetwalkers			6	3	3	5	4	3	1	8	1	34	
	Others				2	4	1			1	1		9	
Total	58	39	22	20	20	20	20	20	20	18	22	20	299	

From the above table 4.2.3 it can be seen that the survey covered metropolis, medium-size and small-sized cities. Among the 299 questionnaire respondents, 117 (39.13%) worked at high-end EEs, and 182 (60.87%) worked at middle to low-end EEs.

4.1.2 Basic Data of the Interview Respondents

In the 69 interview cases collected from 12 cities, the gender and occupation (workplace or occupation) were as follows: 25 EE owners or madams received interview (including 17 female, 7 male and 1 transgender), accounting for 36.2% of the total interviewed; 30 sex workers at EEs were interviewed (20 female and 10 male) accounting for 43.5%; 6 sex workers at rental houses were interviewed, including 1 male and 5 transgender and accounted for 8.7%; 6 streetwalkers were interviewed who were all female (8.7%); there were also 1 mistress and 1 intervention peer educators received interview (please refer to table 4.3). Findings and results of the qualitative research are presented in Chapter 6&7 of this report.

4.3 Gender and Workplace Data of Interview Respondents

Occupation	Female	Male	TransGender	Total
Owners of EEs/Madams	17 (39.5%)	7 (35%)	1 (16.7%)	25 (36.2%)
Sex workers in EEs	20(including 4 Peer Educators) (46.5%)	10(including 2 Peer Educators) (50%)	0	30 (43.5%)
Rental Houses	0	1 (5%)	5 (83.3%)	6 (8.7%)
Streetwalkers	6 (14%)	0	0	6 (8.7%)
Mistress 包养	0	1 (5%)	0	1 (1.4%)
Others (intervention educators)	0	1 (5%)	0	1 (1.4%)
Total	43 (100%)	20 (100%)	6 (100%)	69

4.2 Respondents Experience of Crackdowns by Public Security before 2010

4.2.1 Questionnaire Respondents Experience

An overwhelming crackdown on sex work happens each year in China. Among the 299 questionnaire respondents, 135 (45%) reported experiences of crackdowns by public security, 22³ in Beijing, 19 in Tianjin, 18 in Jiaozhou, 16 in Gejiu, 10 in Guangzhou, 9 each in Ruili and Wuhan, 8 each in Shanghai and Shenyang, 7

³ The research in Beijing and Tianjin both were conducted by 2 groups therefore the number of samples is bigger.



in Kunming, 5 in Qingdao and 4 in Jiangyou. From table 4.5, we can tell that 32.99% (32 among 97) money boys have experienced crackdowns by public security, while female sex workers and transgender sex workers who have experienced crackdown were 48.69% (93/191) and 90.91% (10/11) respectively.

4.4 General Crackdown Experience of Respondents 1

Crack down experience	Male		Female		TransGender		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Yes	32	32.99%	93	48.69%	10	90.91%	135	45%
No	64	65.98%	95	49.74%	1	9.09%	160	54%
N/A	1	1.03%	3	1.57%	0	0.00%	4	1%
Total	97		191		11		299	100%

Among 299 respondents, 135 said that they have experienced crackdowns: 133 respondents had faced with fines, detention and/or violence from public security. Among all respondents, most of the transgender sex workers and about half female sex workers have experienced crackdowns. In addition to fines and detention, about 4.7% (9/96) female sex workers have experienced violence (please refer to table 4.5).

4.5 General Crackdown Experience of Respondents 2

	Male		Female		TransGender		Total	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Fine	15	15.46	33	17.28	1	9.09	49	16.39
Detention	11	11.34	21	10.99	6	54.55	38	12.71
Violence	0	0	9	4.71	1	9.09	10	3.34
All above	2	2.06	32	16.75	2	18.18	36	12.04
Total	28	28.87	95	49.74	10	90.91	133	44.48



4.2.2 Stories of Crackdown Experiences

From the interviews, the intensity and influence of the crackdown in the past ten years are highlighted.

The owner and madam of a night club in Beijing recounted her experience of an impressive crackdown she experienced when she was working ten years ago:

"As I remember, the inspection on sex work was very strict in 2000. Once caught, you would be directly sent to QiLi Station. Many people I knew had been in QiLi Station, and I had been there as well. I was then newly arrived in Beijing, and put straight into QiLi Station even before I got my first client. After that, we were forced onto a train with only a ticket valued at 600 yuan. I ran out after staying at home for a year because there was nothing I could do at home. The crackdown was the most strict in 2000. We were all sitting in the hall and they just started to confiscate and capture people. All of the captured people were sent home by train, one after another. I had just been there for two or three days but didn't know anyone. The policemen just took us away" (Ms. Huang, Madam in Beijing).

An owner and madam in Qingdao talked out the crackdowns she has witnessed:

"Police often came to capture people in recent years. It happened here but I was not at the place then. They took one of my assistants away. I went to bring her some clothes in the detention house, but unfortunately the police detained me for a full day as well. That was in the autumn of 2006. They sent me out after they took my information and had it on record. In 2003, a policeman surnamed Huang captured a streetwalker and beat her to death. They said she had a heart attack and died in that detention house" (Owner/Madam, Yezi in Qingdao).

5. Characteristics of Crackdowns in 2020

Crackdowns on sex work are already common for sex workers and people reliant on this industry. But the strict crackdowns in 2010 were an exception. We tried to identify the crackdowns influence on sex work and HIV prevention by analyzing the characteristics of the crackdowns in 2010.

5.1 Wide-Range, Long-Lasting and Intensive

Table 5.1 details of crackdowns in 2010

City	No. of Respondents	Have crackdowns been conducted in 2010?			
		Yes	Percentage (%)	No	Don't know
Beijing	58	48	82.76		10
Tianjin	39	39	100		



Shanghai	22	22	100		
Qingdao	19	19	100		
Jiaozhou	20	20	100		
Shenyang	20	18	90	1	1
Guangzhou	20	20	100		
Wuhan	20	20	100		
Kunming	20	19	95		1
Gejiu	18	18	100		
Ruili	22	16	72.73	6	
Jiangyou	20	20	100		
Total	296	277	93.58	7	12

From the Table 5.1 above, 277 respondents (184 females, 82 males and 11 transgender) out of 296, or 93.58%, believed that the local public security had conducted crackdowns, while 12 respondents (all male, working in Shenyang, Beijing and Kunming) reported that they were not sure. Only 7⁴ people (6 females in Ruili, 1 male in Shenyang) believed that no crackdowns on sex work had been conducted. Until December 2010, 175 respondents clearly expressed that the crackdowns have not ended and did not know when they would end.

"When did the crackdowns start this year? Around June or July. Yes, they have crackdowns everywhere." A conversation like this common in this study. From the suspension of business in "Tian Shang Ren Jian" to the normalization of secret inquiries, the crackdown continued in 2010 but went much further. Crackdowns happened in all the 12 cities that CSWONF members worked, from Beijing to a small city like Jiangyou, Gejiu.

Crackdowns usually happened during the holidays, national conferences or other special activities in past years, but the public security authorities in all cities have stepped-up the crackdowns, inspired by the zero-tolerance movement in Beijing and assignments from the Public Security Bureau (PSB). For example, the authorities in Shanghai and Guangzhou have more support to conduct crackdowns on sex work due to the World Expo and the Asian Games. Even in Gejiu, a city in the border areas, the local authorities intensified their crackdowns during the municipal celebration, the World Expo and the Asian Games. In Qingdao, in order to establish a civilized city, the city established a centralized management system. Other cities like Wuhan followed.

Testimonials:

⁴ the 6 respondents who believed that no crackdown conducting include 6 females in Ruili and 1 male in Shenyang.



The crackdowns this year was because of the 60th Annual Celebration of Gejiu City, the Asian Games and the World Expo. Even my place was shut down for over a month. Some people gossiped that I had people inside, but I did not explain. This was all maintained by money. Around eight of my girls were taken into detention this year and I bought them out (Madam in Gejiu).

The crackdowns lasted longer this year than before. The police had told us that we are not allowed to have sex workers in the stores. When they first started happening, it was really scary (Madam in Qingdao).

In addition to the expanding areas and long period of the crackdowns, they further intensified in 2010. The detention and fines on sex workers happened more frequently. Among all the respondents who answered the question "is there any difference between the crackdowns this year and the ones in former years," 209 of them reported that the crackdowns lasted even longer, 194 believed that the crackdown struck in broader regions. Furthermore, 119 respondents thought that more people were detained and fined in the crackdowns, while only 26 people saw no difference from past ones.

They destroyed the houses, no matter who the owners were. My place was destroyed as well. The girls were taken, as was I. The destruction of the houses happened in July or August. I heard that the police would come to inspect but they all had their quotas to fill. They just smashed everything and forbid us to open up. I was detained for 15 days until my friend paid a 4,000 RMB fine for me. Another girl was caught while working, and they did not even want money; they just wanted to lock her up for half a year (Owner, female in Wuhan).

It was very strict this year. They even detained the servers and performers (Owner/Madam, Yezi, in Qingdao).

It has never happened like this. We heard about the strict crackdowns in May, but the inspections only started in June. It was the most strict in the beginning. The plain-clothes police came everyday and detained around 30 people in over 10 places from June to November. Three places were raided twice. Half of the places were forced to shut down. The police station did not give any notice before the crackdowns. They used to just happen symbolically during holidays, but they formed a special team this year. The policemen came to inspect everyday in police cars and civilian cars. They spied on us, it was quite weird (Owner/Madam, in Qingdao).

They searched each house. Hotels were required to set up networking systems, otherwise, they could not open for business. They drove in police cars here a few times everyday and stood on each street. If we dared to walk out, they would just arrest us. An in-house inspection started in August to clear out the girls in rental houses. They would even take a ladder just to stop the girls from jumping out. Plain-clothes police rushed to catch us once they saw us go out to work from the top of the corridors of the residential communities (Streetwalker in Qingdao).

5.2 Many EEs Shut Down, Clients and Earnings Decreased

Among 299 respondents who answered the questionnaire, 281 answered the question 'are there any EEs shut down because of the crackdowns' and the question 'the number of clients each week after crackdowns'; 279 respondents answered the question 'do you think the number of sex workers changed after the crackdown started?'; and 278 respondents answered the question 'rice of sex services after the 2010 crackdown' (table 5.2).



Under the strict crackdown situation in 2010, 62.28% (175/281) of sex workers thought that the EEs had shut down, and 63.44% (177/279) of them said the number of sex workers and the number of clients decreased (62.99%). Female sex workers were the group that were most affected; 80% of them reported that the number of clients per week had decreased.

Table 5.2 Effects of the crackdowns on EEs and earnings in 2010

Sex (No./ Percentage)	Male	Female	Transgender	Total
	Question 1: Are there any EEs in your place that have shut down because of the crackdowns? (281 out of 299 respondents answered this question, accounting for 93.98% of the total)			
Don't know	24/28%	47/25%	4/36%	75/27%
No	11/13%	20/11%	0	31/11%
Yes	50/59%	118/64%	7/64%	175/62%
Total	85/100%	185/100%	11/100%	281/100%
	Question 2: Do you think the number of sex workers changed after the crackdown started? (279 out of 299 respondents answered this question, accounting for 93% of the total)			
Increased	5/5.8%	6/3.3%	1/9.1%	12/4.3%
Decreased	51/59.3%	119/65.4%	7/63.6%	177/63.4%
Unchanged	19/22.1%	28/15.4%	2/18.2%	49/17.6%
Did not know	11/12.8%	29/15.9%	1/9.1%	41/14.7%
Total	86/100%	182/100%	11/100%	279/100%
	Question 3: Number of clients in each week after the crackdown (281 out of 299 respondents answered this question, accounting for 93.98%)			
Decreased	24/28%	148/80%	5/45.5%	177/63%
Inceased	11/13%	6/3.2%	1/9%	18/6.4%
Unchanged	50/59%	31/16.8%	5/45.5%	86/30.6%
Total	85/100%	185/100%	11/100%	281/100%
	Question 4: Price of sex services after the crackdown (278 out of 299 respondents answered this question, accounting for 92.98%)			
Went Down	17/20.2%	57/31.15%	1/9.1%	75/27%
Went Up	4/4.8%	11/6.01%	0	15/5.4%
Unchanged	63/75%	115/62.84%	10/90.9%	188/67.6%
Total	84/100%	183/100%	11/100%	278/100%

The intensified crackdowns significantly affected sex workers' earnings because many EEs shut down and clients were lost, even though the prices remained unchanged. This was a common phenomenon in each city



covered in the research. During the Asian Games, the researcher noticed while arranging interviews in a hair salon in Zhujiang village that almost half of the EEs had shut down in Jinguang, Guangzhou. In the hair salons, we did not see any clients the entire afternoon. In the beginning, the madam denied that there were any sex workers, but came out to say hello only after outreach workers began distributing free condoms.

Xiaobai: We cannot make too much money even during a good season, just seven to eight thousand yuan (per month). In a bad season, sometimes we earn just one thousand a month. It's very hard now because of the strict crackdowns.

Question: How much can you make in a week?

Xiaobai: Now? Just three or four hundred.

(Xiaobai, a money boy in Kunming)

We dared not work when crackdowns were common. Earnings decreased; this year was the least ever since I began, because the crackdowns had lasted too long. Some EEs that had people detained by police were shut down, that indicates the cruelty of it all. Five of my girls were caught and all were released after being fined. I could not even remember the number of in-house inspections. Some owners were harassed by police as well. It was hard for us (Owner of a karaoke house in Gejiu).

In other cities, over 95% of the respondents reported that EEs had shut down, and the earnings of the owners and sex workers decreased.

Analysis of the reasons of decrease of clients, decrease of income and shut-down of EEs shows that, crackdowns have resulted deterioration of the working environment of the sex industry, but doesn't mean that sex workers quit the job—they are more likely to work in more obscure places with high mobility; even they don't use condoms to meet clients' requirements. Under this circumstances, the risks of affecting HIV have increased (please refer to Table 5.4 After the anti-pornography campaign, strategies that sex workers took).

5.3 Regional Characteristics and Differences in the Crackdowns

Against the backdrop of the crackdowns in 2010, it is worth mentioning that the anti-porn campaigns in the 12 cities participating in this research were not the same. According to interviews, Qingdao, Gejiu, Wuhan, et al, were perceived as relatively stricter; Qingdao implemented a comprehensive initiative. Beijing began earlier, with great intensity, but was still moderate, especially in terms of their method of shutting down establishments that eased the tension a bit. In the cities with milder campaigns, like Jiangyou, a female sex worker and an EE owner said:

There are 50 clients on average every day. No strict crackdowns; [we have] more than 80 clients. No, I have never experienced the police's strict crackdown and anti-porn campaign, they didn't even come to inspect (performer at a tea house and peer educator, Lijie, Jiangyou).

[The police] wanted to have a meeting with us, about the public security and a joint defense. We have done this for so many years, we know we have to escape and so don't do business during certain events. The police came, for example, to inspect IDs, but they didn't inspect other things. Other establishments wanted to dawdle and dawdle, and then got inspected. I wouldn't change my career or suspend my business because of the



crackdowns. The campaign did influence me this year. Female sex workers/xiaomei almost didn't go out (chutai). There are fewer clients. But we still want to earn money. Our establishment and female sex workers haven't been punished, but have been affected (EE owner, Weijie, Jiangyou).

Even with the campaign, they [authorities] just inspect IDs, and ask questions; even if they catch an establishment in the act, they will only scold and fine. Beating and humiliation is little:

Some close the door. Low-level establishments that close the door are fewer. Someone gets caught. Find an acquaintance, form relationships/guanxi, and submit the fine, 5,000 Yuan. They would question us, sometimes scold us, call us bitches and hookers, but they don't beat us. Although they have beaten and scolded us in the past, now they don't beat us. Their attitude to us is very bad. We have to be honest with them to avoid a beating (Female sex worker with 2 kids, more than 40 years old, from the countryside, Jiangyou).

I saw the police car coming towards us on the street, and several cops inspected the establishment. They ask where you are from, and ask to see your ID. They also inspect our facilities. We use red-yellow light, we don't dare to use red light during the anti-porn campaign. Three or four establishments closed because of the campaign, but one of them re-opened. After some people were arrested, they were re-educated through labor; some were detained and fined; detained for about half a month, and re-educated through labor for a year. The fine is 5,000 Yuan (Female sex worker, divorced, Jiangyou).

Many of the regional characteristics and differences are related to local economic development, management of establishments and special circumstances (e.g. celebration and interaction, international conference, inspection, police leader change, etc.), but more important is the interaction between the police and the sex workers. A 26 year old female sex workers in Gejiu summarized her career experience in many regions, and compared the characteristics and differences among Beijing, Guangzhou, Kunming and Gejiu:

I began as a sex worker in 2006, and have been to Beijing, Guangzhou and Kunming. It was easy to make money in Guangzhou. The price in Beijing was high, but the police could come anytime, so I only did it for a year in Beijing and then went back to Yunnan with several sisters. The price in Guangzhou is middle to high among the places I have been to, and the owners there had a good relationship with the police. I didn't experience crackdowns in Guangzhou; at most, I didn't do business for awhile. In Kunming, we rotated between establishments, and made good money. Because I missed home, I went back to Gejiu finally. I have many acquaintances there, and if anything happens, I can find someone to help (EE female sex worker, Gejiu).

However, she did experience crackdowns in her hometown, and was humiliated.

To establish effective relationships/guanxi, one first needs to find backstage supporters, and then an understanding of EE owners' operation, getting relevant information in advance, cultivating a reaction strategy and even special protection. Two female EE owners in Gejiu said straightforwardly:

The crackdowns haven't stopped this year; several establishments closed their doors last month. Only those establishments with relationships/guanxi can continue their business. Actually, the relationships are bought by money. The information they receive were tips such as not to open the door or not to put condoms in the establishment. Sometimes, we didn't have any other strategies, so we closed the doors. The purpose of the anti-porn campaign is money (Female owner of a karaoke bar, Gejiu).



The relationship/guanxi between the police and myself is bought by money. Sometimes when they come, I would let a few beautiful young female sex workers accompany them. It is a so-called "sex bribery." But if I didn't do this, I couldn't survive in this industry. Today's world is money's world.... This anti-porn campaign is because of Gejiu's 60-year City Celebration, and some time ago it was because of the Asian Games and World Expo. I even had to close my business for more than a month; other owners all said I had guanxi, but I wouldn't explain anything. This kind of guanxi is maintained by money. About seven or eight female sex workers /xiaomei were arrested this year, and came out by paying the fine. (Owner of EE /Mami, female, Gejiu).

An MB and clubhouse owner An'an in Shanghai admitted that he had two backstage supporters, one is his godfather, who rescued him to avoid labor re-education, and gave him relevant information and suggestions; another one is anonymous. He said:

I was caught by the police.... then sent to Jiangxi and sentenced for two years. I called my godfather, and then I was released and didn't go to Jiangxi. Actually, to do this business, I think one needs backstage supporters, which is better. After the World Expo, my godfather warned me on November 3 (beginning of the strict crackdowns). I sent all my MBs away, they couldn't be in the place of the crackdowns. After December 15, the crackdowns were looser. They began to destroy hair salons or others...(MB and owner, Shanghai).

The interaction is mutual. We are not sure what this MB used to connect with this godfather, but a female owner told us the secret to yield returns from those in power was to assign money and lease beauty. Owner Yezi in Qingdao said:

In any district of Qingdao, they [police] will target several establishments. Every district has some protected establishments, so they won't go to those, or they will inform them in advance. Usually, they will organize a meeting for owners in advance, and tell us about their work arrangements during this period, asking us to cooperate, not to mess it up; You can declare a holiday, or avoid it in some other way, just not to mess things up in their district. We had a meeting this May or June, after the World in Heaven /Tianshang Renjian event in Beijing. Sometimes, they will inform us of unannounced visits, and then one day, show up to inspect, so sometimes we will go on a holiday, at most two days; sometimes, we close the door, and only accept regular clients that come in through secret passages (Owner/mami, Yezi, Qingdao).

If the relationship/guanxi goes well, someone in the anti-porn campaign office will personally tell them how to react:

Sometimes, a person would come to say no female sex workers are allowed in the establishment, and in the beginning, we were very nervous. Then the inside person would tell you what to do, to change the female sex workers' clothes to waitresses; if there are five clients in an establishment, then arrange four female sex workers (not the exact number), clients and female sex workers sitting opposite to each other in two rows (Owner/mami, Yezi, Qingdao).

For a low-level establishment, there are different measures to protect these establishments in Jiangyou; for example, Qingdao's measure is:

The high-level places, if caught are fined and kept on record at most; but the low-level ones are different, usually subject to criminal detention if caught (Owner/mami, Yezi, Qingdao).



From the above stories, we found that the relationship between the police and EE owners and sex workers is subtle. Apart from conducting anti-porn tasks in crackdowns, the police could also become the backstage supporter of the ‘illegal’ EE owners and sex workers.

Beijing is another situation. As the capital, Beijing has rich experiences in launching anti-porn campaigns, and has to consider its international influence and national image. Their method is to crackdown but also restructure, distributing work cards and wearing work uniforms in the establishments. These methods not only control people’s movements but also the sex trade, especially for those sex workers going out/chutai. Also, they ease the relationship between the police and the industry, stabilizing practitioners’ emotion and work.

Now it’s work card. If you have the card, you are relatively secure in this establishment.... The police come to inspect all the time, but it doesn’t have much influence, they just come to inspect the work card. They don’t inspect the clients. We have nothing to worry about. We are not scared because we have the work cards. Of course, we will worry if we don’t have the work cards. The owner and mami remind us to swipe the card, swipe the card every day.... We have more regular clients. There are more regular clients, less new clients. We are not allowed to go out/chutai, but it doesn’t influence us much. We can still attract clients (Female sex worker of a night club, Kaixuan, Beijing).

After experiencing 2,000 anti-porn campaigns, Huangjie was sent back to her hometown, and she became an owner of a nightclub. She said:

Basically, they only inspect work uniforms and work cards. We all are the same.... my club was closed for a while this year, however they can they will mess you a little. I closed for a month. These two years, I haven’t been caught in other establishments. Now the police’s attitude is just so-so, just like that. Aside from the police, the firefighters also came to inspect. The police only check the rooms, very simple, check the work cards, they won’t affect the clients inside. They know this kind of establishment is for going out/chutai, for this stuff, and the police can’t control it. Although they know, they don’t have anything to say (Huangjie, Beijing).

The strictness of the anti-porn campaign has many unpredictable factors, like the crackdown on MBs and transgenders. MBs in Beijing, and EE owners claimed there was nothing going on, but it was very serious in Kunming. It was rumored that MBs and transgenders in Kunming were targeted, the police knew them, and would arrest them once seeing them on the road. However, Laosi in Qingdao of Shandong was protected because transgenders were rare.

I told them I was a man; they let me out without any questions. I am the only ‘evil spirit’ in our region. They don’t care about me. If there were more, they would control us. Sisters weren’t beaten or scolded after being arrested, the police would just shout out: “Get the hell out, it is a strict period!” (Owner/mami, transgender, Laosi, Qingdao).

5.4 More Severe Punishment and Violence in Law Enforcement

Prostitution is still illegal in China. According to the law, there are some behaviors that still constitute a crime. In 2010, because of the anti-pornography campaigns, almost every region made improvements in the enforcement and administration of the anti-porn campaign, compared to the past. In interviews, findings show that Guangzhou, Beijing, Shanghai, Jiangyou, Wuhan, etc. didn’t use fines as the main means of enforcement.

The Ministry of Public Security even issued a document prohibiting breaking the law while enforcing it, such as blackmailing, beating, abusing, raping, etc. However, violence carried out during the enforcement of the anti-porn campaign is still a serious problem.

According to the questionnaire's data, 98 respondents (20 males, 71 females and 7 transgender) out of 299 answered the question about the behavior they encountered by the police in 2010 during anti-pornography campaigns, and many of them encountered more than one type of behaviors.. 79 respondents were questioned by the police, 43 were subject to body searches, 31 respondents were beaten, 22 respondents were blackmailed, and 4 respondents were harassed in other ways by the police. 20.62% male sex workers were questioned or beaten by the police during crackdowns, and the percentage of this among male and transgender sex workers was 37.33% and 32.78% respectively (please see Table 5.3)..

Table 5.3 During the 2010 Crackdown, Behaviors that the Police Took to Sex Workers (Gender Disaggregated)

	Male		Female		Transgender		Total
	No. Of male	Rate of male group	No. of female	Rate of female group	No. Of transgender	Rate of transgender group	Total number/ rate
Total	20	20.62%	71	37.33%	7	63.63%	98/32.78%
Questioned	16	16.49%	57	30.321%	6	54.55%	79/26.42%
Body searched	6	6.19%	33	17.55%	4	36.36%	43/14.38%
Beaten	3	3.09%	27	14.36%	0	0%	31/10.37%
Blackmailed	3	3.09%	19	10.11%	0	0%	22/7.36%
Other	1	1.03%	2	1.06%	1	9.09%	4/1.34%

Note: some respondents encountered more than one type of behavior from the police.

58 respondents admitted that they were caught by the police in 2010 crackdown, accounting for 19.4% (58/299). One sex worker⁵ had been arrested for 3 times, 8 sex workers had been caught twice, and 49 sex workers had been caught once. In the survey, respondents mentioned being beaten (41), slapped (39), having money confiscated (33), hair dragged (22), electrically shocked (16), hair cut (7), raped (4), and 14 respondents mentioned other forms of violence.

From the surveys and interviews, we can see that illegal means of law enforcement, like extended stay, baiting, backwards fishing (*diaoyu*), smashing, robbery, even brutal beating and rape, etc. existed in some regions.

⁵ 1 female sex worker in Shanghai.



The interview material shows that violence to female groups and transgender groups were more common, harsher in both the degree and form of expression, and even unimaginable insult and harm to women.

This September, three sisters/FSWs and me were accompanying several bosses/clients.... A sister was doing it with a boss, and the door of room was kicked open, and the police caught them in the act. The bosses were brought out, and three cops came in. They threatened us at first, asking us to reveal the boss's situation; then they made us do a strip dance together, saying that whoever danced best could go. We sisters danced so hard, not wanting to become entangled with them. At last, they decided I was good, and one of them who seemed to be in charge told me to give him a blow job. Another one wanted anal sex. They discussed whether oral sex or anal sex was cleaner, which wouldn't transmit diseases. What could we do? It's in God's hands.... (Clubhouse female sex worker, 26 years old, Gejiu, Yunnan).

In July (2010), after 5:00 pm, 3 extended-stay (dunkeng) people rushed in suddenly.... They arrested the owner and female sex workers. In the police station, the police hung her on the tree with a handcuff, beat her with a wooden stick, forcing her to admit to prostitution; if she didn't, they would beat her again. They lifted her clothes and skirt to see if she wore bra and underwear, and touched her breasts. When she admitted that she charged 100 yuan for one time, they beat her again, asking why she charged 150 yuan when they came once. These police had all visited prostitutes. When it got dark, mosquitoes stung her and caused her to cry out. The old man that watched the door pitied her, untied her rope, and tied her back after dawn. The next morning, they asked her to give them her money, or they would send her to detention; if she gave them 10,000 yuan, they would let her go immediately, with no receipt.... One of the female sex workers was so frightened she developed a mental disorder, and would run to restroom whenever she saw anyone coming. Now she has gone home (EE owner/mami and female sex worker, Jiaozhou, Shandong).

I was arrested on October 18, 2010. They didn't catch me in the act; the client just came in and we hadn't talked about the price. I was caught in the afternoon, and was released noon the next day (October 19). I was beaten by the police after my arrest. The neighbor's owner voluntarily helped find someone (guanxi) to pay to get me out (Wangjie, EE owner, 34 years old, Tianjin).

The client just came in and we hadn't begun yet when the police came in. I paid a 3,000 yuan fine for my release (Question: You didn't even begin, why did you give them the money?) It's out of my control. (Question: Were you beaten?) There is no way to avoid being beaten. If they didn't beat me, would I pay them 3,000 yuan (Tianjin).

They caught about 20 to 30 people this year. Usually people are fined 5,000 yuan, detained for 15 days. At least 7 to 10 people were re-educated through labor. They beat us very hard after our arrest. A sister/FSW wasn't caught in the act by police, but was afraid of re-education through labor, and refused to admit to prostitution, so was beaten black and blue on a tiger bench. She was out after 12 hours, and fined 2000 yuan. Another sister/FSW also wouldn't admit to wrongdoing, so they roller her limbs with an electric stick, and sent her to re-education camp (Street-standing girl, 20 years old, Jiaozhou, Shandong).

During the strict crackdowns, if you were caught, even if your earnings didn't go down, you just didn't feel like you had a future. Instead, you have fear, nightmares, and tension. Our establishment had 5 female sex workers before, but now there is only one, who lost her soul after being released, and couldn't sleep (EE owner/mami, Jiaozhou, Shandong).

Illegal behavior during enforcement of the anti-porn campaign often reflected stark gender discrimination, expressed through stringency to females and flexibility to males. MB and male EE owners said:

For us, the anti-porn campaign meant no clients dared to come out, so business wasn't good, but we won't close our business or switch to other work, etc. The police basically target the females in the anti-porn campaign, but it doesn't influence us, the males, no big influence (club owner, male, Beijing).

5.5 Policy at the Top, Strategies on the Ground

According to the questionnaire, most sex workers took measures to respond to the anti-porn campaign. In Table 5.3, 159 respondents chose to stop engaging in sex work temporarily; meanwhile, many respondents chose to turn to more obscure establishments/way, or change establishments frequently (110 respondents and 60 respondents respectively), but many still didn't bring and use condoms.

Table 5.4 After the Anti-Pornography Campaign, Strategies that Sex Workers Took

Strategy	No. of respondents using it	Rate of all respondents
Temporarily stop engaging in sex work	159	53.2%
Continue doing in more obscure establishments or in more obscure way	110	36.8%
Change establishments more frequently	60	20%
Not bring condoms	48	16.1%
Not use condoms	14	4.7%
No special strategy	30	10%
Other	16	5.4%

Note: some respondents took more than one strategies.

From the result above, it can be seen that the main strategy sex workers took is 'evading': they tend to work in more obscure places and change work places more frequently; they don't bring or use condoms under the pressure of circumstances and clients. All of these risky strategies are potential barriers to HIV intervention and prevention.

According to the experience of tackling past anti-porn campaigns, in addition to bribery, seeking favour and using back door connections, the strategies that EE owners took were: (1) closing (shutting down temporarily, the most common); (2) moving (move the establishment); (3) disguise appearances (disguise, sometimes suggested by the police); (4) switching to other work (very few).

When the environment is strict, we have to shut down. We don't dare open the door. It's the inspecting, requiring us not to do illegal things, asking us if we have a license, if not we can't open for business. When the police come, our strategy is to shut down. I think safety is the most important thing. The campaign has become more frequent, sometimes they come every 2 to 3 days, and sometimes they come every day (EE owner-1, female, Guangzhou).



The anti-porn campaign makes us move a lot. If there is a strict crackdown and no business in this district, we will move to another district, or close for a week, and accept some regular clients' business. This district is Korean street, and there are many Korean clients here, so there haven't been strict crackdown in this district before (EE owner, female, Jiaozhou).

The police inspections have been very strict this year. Many beauty parlors/falangs closed, some turned to other businesses, some went back home. This strict crackdown is because of the Asian Games. Yes, especially during the Asian Games, we couldn't do any business at all, so we did some floral work in the establishment, so the police wouldn't figure out what we did (EE owner-2, female, Guangzhou).

Now it's the anti-porn campaign, but I'm not saying I will quit. Unless they forbid this establishment to open, otherwise I will figure out a strategy. Many establishments are watched, letting female sex workers dress in uniform, as waitresses. It's a suggestion the institution gives us, with a standard of management, and if someone comes to inspect us, we will say we are waitresses or wine promoters. It's not that I will close the door once the campaign begins (EE owner/mami, Yezi, Qingdao).

Sex workers in and outside establishments also had their strategies: (1) hiding; (2) outside; (3) quick; (4) not on the body. "Hiding" means to stop working and hiding at home during the anti-porn campaign; "outside" means not doing business inside the establishment, renting a room and seeing regular clients in the interim; "quick" means doing a "fast food" style deal in the establishment; "not on the body" means not bringing condoms to the room, in case they become evidence of prostitution.

[During strict crackdowns on the establishment] female sex workers don't come to the establishment, they only do business with regular clients outside (EE owner, female, Gejiu).

No shortcuts; I can only be more discreet. Even without condoms, I will do what I have to, the most important thing is to be quick. I only do it in the establishment, all I ask is to be quick, because I don't have money to rent a house outside (owner of foot massage establishment/female sex worker, Tianjin).

I don't bring condoms with me, but put them in the sex service room. If I have a condom when caught, how would I explain it? (female streetwalker, Tianjin).

Differences between male sex workers' strategies from female sex workers are more opportunities and more methods; for example, seeking back door connections, provisions for cunning escape, various resource capital, etc. MB and EE owner An'an in Shanghai showed that he had 12 moneymakers (there were 12 MBs earning money for him in the club); however, he felt fear because of a lack of a sense of security, and had to make many preparations to react to the anti-porn campaign:

.... There are many MBs /xiaodi in Shanghai, and many of them are working for themselves. Today is different from before. Last year, business was easy, and fewer MBs were working for themselves. Like this year, lots of MBs are working for themselves. MBs stay here for a while, half a month, some for a month, at most a month, and then they will go out and work for themselves. My money was transferred back home to my mom's account because if I get caught one day, the police will say this money is not clean, and they will confiscate it for whatever reason. It's Xiaozhang who taught me this.



I have patrons in Shanghai; two people will cover my back. For me, I am not afraid. I do business very safely; my MBs live in one place, and we do business in one place, but I live in another place. My establishment is in the name of pub; I have a pub license and a tour guide license. Using these two licenses as mortgage, they can't arrest me. Even if one day my MBs were arrested, you wouldn't be able to arrest me. I have these licenses, you can check. I admit that I am gay, but what evidence do you have to prove what I'm doing? Moreover, the place I am living in seems like a home for two people, like office workers' home, so you can't arrest me. I have three places, this is what my godfather says to me, so how can you arrest me? (MB and EE owner, An'an, Shanghai).

6. Influence of the Anti-Pornography Campaign on Sex Work and HIV/AIDS Prevention

6.1 Professional Security is still Sex Workers Major Concern

This questionnaire also conducted findings of past research and investigations. Under the crackdowns, safety is still sex workers' major concern, including not being found out by their family and not being caught by the police.

The findings from the interviews are the same as those of the questionnaire. Both EE owners and all kinds of sex workers believe that safety and health were the most important, and money was less important. Only when safety is guaranteed will they earn money. The interview and questionnaire answers also show that, sex workers (83.87%) including male, female and transgender, showed their concern that bringing and using condoms can become evidences of prostitution. It illustrates that although sex workers have the awareness of HIV/STI prevention, they could give up bringing or using condoms due to crackdowns in order to avoid being arrested by the police. It would result in more risks of STI/HIV transmission; therefore, crackdowns bring potential barriers to the safety of sex work and HIV prevention (please refer to table 6.1).

Table 6.1 After the Anti-Pornography Campaign, Risks that Sex Workers Are Most Concerned About

Risk	Female	Male	Transgender	Total
1. Afraid to be found out by your family after arrest (279 respondents out of 299, 93%)				
Afraid	182	81	11	274 (98.21%)
Not afraid	2	3	0	5 (1.79%)
2. Afraid to be caught by the police (280 respondents out of 299, 96%)				
Afraid	179	85	10	269 (96.07%)
Not afraid	6	5	0	11 (3.93%)
3. Afraid that clients won't use condoms (277 respondents out of 299, 92%)				
Afraid	173	75	10	258 (93.14%)
Not afraid	9	9	1	19 (6.86%)



4. Afraid that there will be fewer clients (281 respondents out of 299, 93%)				
Afraid	168	75	10	253 (90.04%)
Not afraid	17	11	0	28 (9.96%)
5. Afraid that condoms will be used as evidence of doing sex work (279 respondents out of 299, 93%)				
Afraid	161	67	6	234 (83.87%)
Not afraid	23	18	4	45 (16.13%)

6.2 Little Change in Bringing and Using Condoms, but Some Reduction

In table 6.2, we can see that the rate of female sex workers bringing and using condoms is relatively less, and the rate of female sex workers who never bring condoms is higher than male sex workers. It also shows from the survey that the rate of sex workers who never bring condoms is quite high, be they female, male or transgender, which is up to 16.4%. after crackdown, sex workers that less carry condoms reached near 30%. In terms of condom use, nearly 20% sex workers admitted that they less use condoms. All these behaviors have increased their risks of affecting STI/HIV.

Table 6.2 Before and After the Anti-Pornography Campaign, a Comparison of Bringing and Using Condoms

		Female		Male		Transgender		Total	
		No.	Rate	No.	Rate	No.	Rate	No.	Rate
Bringing Condoms	More often	23	12.4%	10	11.8%	2	18.2%	35	12.5%
	Less	53	28.7%	24	28.2%	4	36.4%	81	28.8%
	No change	66	35.7%	48	56.5%	5	45.4%	119	42.3%
	Never	43	23.2%	3	3.5%	0	0	46	16.4%
	Sub-Total	185		85		11		281	
Using Condoms	Less	48	26%	8	9.4%	0	0	56	19.9%
	More	38	20.5%	12	14.12%	1	9.1%	51	18.1%
	No change	99	53.5%	65	76.5%	10	90.9%	174	61.9%
	Sub-total	185		85		11		281	



In the interviews, the findings suggest that health knowledge and awareness of sex workers is very strong, especially among males and transgenders.

Now condom use is pretty high. The price of not using a condom depends on different people. People's thoughts are very different from each other. I know some people here will never do it if you don't use a condom, no matter how much money you will add! Through training, many sisters began to realize that safety and health are the most important (EE owner/mami, transgender, Laosi, Qingdao).

95% of my clients are playing the 0 role. They explain that it's not comfortable to use a condom. They propose not to use a condom, but I will always say no. If he insists on not using a condom, the I will insist not to do it. I can't play with my life just for a few hundreds yuan (MB, Tianjin).

6.3 The Effects of Crackdown on HIV/AIDS Prevention and Intervention

6.3.1 Community Grassroots Organizations and Peer Educators

In terms of health and safety outreach for EEs and sex workers, community grassroots organizations and peer educators have had a more significant impact than the CDC. They are an important force in HIV/AIDS prevention, and are praised by EE owners and sex workers:

The CDC or government never come here. Health Center comes to our establishment once a month, distributing condoms, brochures and Love/Aixin Special Issue to female sex workers. The staff of the center also brings several female sex workers to teach our female sex workers to learn condom use, give pregnancy and abortion information, STIs prevention, and important profession-related information. They also do gynecological exams and blood testing for our female sex workers in the establishment. We go to the Health Center regularly to do physical exams and blood tests. If they find any disease, they treat us, and the price is very cheap.

Many peer educators are volunteers, build a sense of mission from personal experience, and gradually feel the happiness in helping others in the service. The work that peer educators do in the establishment really changes people's understanding and behavior of condom use.

I was caught by police when doing sex work, and was re-educated through labor for 3 years. I suffered terribly in the re-education camps, and my personality wasn't respected. After I came out, I encountered this field because I was infected with HIV. Thinking about my own experience, I felt that I needed to do something, to prevent young sex workers from becoming infected with HIV. I wanted to warn my sisters/FSWs through my own experience, and to keep using condoms (Female Sex Worker/FSW, PLWH/People Living with HIV, Peer Educator, Gejiu).

Actually I didn't like peer education at first, but after doing it for a long time, we have a connection with each other. Sometimes people come to me, and I have a sense of accomplishment, organizational capacity, leadership ability, showing myself, my sense of responsibility and love. Helping others is a kind of happiness, which is different from my simple streetwalking job. Sometimes people shouldn't care about money too much; sometimes helping a person will make you very happy. Sisters/FSWs trust me very much, I feel very happy! (EE Owner/mami, Transgender, Laosi, Qingdao).



The traditional ideas in China is that it's shameful to hold a condom. But after learning through peer education, we think it's protecting ourselves, because people are selfish. The first thought is definitely for yourself, it's a protection for the self, we will accept it, then use it almost every time, not like before only using it once or never using it (MB, Peer Educator, Tianjin).

6.3.2 Sex Workers

The table 6.3 below shows that the effects of crackdown on HIV intervention from the perspective of sex workers. Almost half sex workers believed that there has little change of free condoms distributed at EEs, whereas 32% sex workers in the survey thought that free distributed condoms had decreased. In terms of intervention activities conducted by CDC, most respondents were not clear. It also shows from the survey that sex workers have a very vague understanding of peer education.

Table 6.3 The Effects of Crackdowns on HIV Intervention from the Perspective of Sex Workers

Change	Female	Male	Transgender	Total
Question 1: Since crackdown began, number of condoms distributed in your establishment (259 out of 299 responded, accounting for 86%)				
Less	63/35.6%	20/25.6%	0	83/32%
More	30/16.9%	13/16.7%	1/25%	44/17%
No change	69/39%	40/51.3%	3/75%	112/43.3%
Not clear	15/8.5%	5/6.4%	0	20/7.7%
Sub-total	177	78	4	259
Question 2: Since crackdown began, CDC staff coming here to hold propaganda and education activities on HIV/AIDS and STIs prevention (259 out of 299 responded, accounting for 86%)				
Less	27/15.3%	5/6.3%	0	32/12.4%
More	37/21%	8/10.1%	1/25%	46/17.7%
No change	35/19.9%	32/40.6%	3/75%	70/27%
Not clear	77/43.8%	34/43%	0	111/42.9%
Sub-total	176	79	4	259
Question 3: Since crackdown began, peer education activities on HIV/AIDS prevention in the establishment (258 out of 299 responded, accounting for 86%)				
Less	54/30.8%	5/6.3%	0	59/22.9%
More	46/26.3%	8/10.2%	0	54/20.9%
No change	46/26.3%	32/40.5%	1/25%	79/30.6%
Not clear	29/16.6%	34/43%	3/75%	66/25.6%
Sub-total	175	79	4	258
Question 4: Since crackdown began, people infected STIs in the establishment (257 out of 299 responded, accounting for 85%)				
Less	21/12.1%	15/19.2%	0	36/14%



More	16/9.1%	6/7.7%	0	22/8.6%
No change	23/13.1%	11/14.1%	1/25%	35/13.6%
Not clear	115/65.7%	46/59%	3/75%	164/63.8%
Sub-total	175	78	4	257

Peer educators thought that, “Campaign against pornography” and “strict crackdown” has destroyed many well-developed HIV/AIDS prevention communities. Previous prevention patterns are gone, and it’s more difficult for sex work peer educators to find target groups, which will decrease the health services provided.

Because of the anti-porn campaign and crackdown, the effects on the work for streetwalking transgenders are massive. We will lose the intervention strategies for them; and then we have to put our focus on interventions for EEs like clubhouses and KTVs (Dajun, Peer Educator, Shenyang).

In addition to peer educators finding it harder to locate target groups, EE owners also require sex workers not to bring condoms (female 74, male 3, transgender 1), or not to use condoms when providing sex services for clients (female 10, male 1), in order to avoid the risk. This may be one response to “being afraid of condoms as evidence of prostitution.”

7. Findings and Recommendations

7.1 Main Findings

7.1.1 The crackdowns resulted in decrease of sex workers, changed operation patterns of EEs and more obscure work place of sex workers

Afraid of the police coming, many establishments changed operation patterns, and were more cautious of strangers. Sex workers would spread out near the club, and if a client likes the photo and wants to see them, the sex worker would return to the club and go out with the client, which clearly increases the difficulties of HIV/AIDS and STI prevention work..

Crackdowns had more serious effects on streetwalkers (including female and transgender sex workers). According to many sex workers, there was more police patrolling in almost every park and areas, so some sex workers working outside had to postpone their solicitation time for several hours. This delay could bring many unsafe factors to sex workers’ professional security, especially personal safety, and increase the difficulties of community organizing interventions.

7.1.2 Sex workers were afraid that carrying and using condoms could become evidence of prostitution in the anti-pornography campaign

Although sex workers have the awareness of HIV/STI prevention, they could give up carrying or using condoms due to crackdowns in order to avoid being arrested by the police. It would result in more risks of STI/HIV transmission. It is a potential risk to safety and health of sex workers brought out by crackdowns.

7.1.3 Crackdowns have increased the vulnerability of sex workers



It is found from the research that crackdowns in 2010 were wide-ranged, long-lasting and intensive. 93% respondents believed that crackdowns had been conducted locally. About 60% thought that EEs near their workplace had been closed, the number of sex workers had decreased and number of clients per week had decreased. 80% female sex workers thought their clients had decreased weekly.

In the meantime, crackdowns cannot eliminate sex work. Most sex workers won't leave the industry because of crackdowns; instead they took some strategies. 83% sex workers chose to stop engaging in sex work temporarily, or turn to more obscure establishments/way, or change establishments frequently, or not carry and use condoms. 83% respondents were afraid that carrying or using condoms could be used as evidence of prostitution which had resulted that 30% sex workers carry condoms less. All of these evidences show that although crackdowns may temporarily decrease the number of sex work places and sex workers, the risks of unsafe sex behaviours have increased for those who still stay in the industry.

7.1.4 Crackdowns have disclosed the illegal behaviours in law enforcement of the police

Although during the crackdown in 2010, the Ministry of Public Security issued a document prohibiting breaking the law while enforcing it, such as blackmailing, beating, abusing, raping, etc. However, it is found in the research that violence carried out during the enforcement of the anti-porn campaign is still a serious problem. About 10% respondents admitted that they have been beaten, among which 14% are female sex workers. In addition, 13% sex workers were beaten in the ear, and 7% were pulled the hair. It is also found during the questionnaire that 4 female sex workers had been raped. Raping has been also found in individual interviews.

7.2 Multiple Views on Crackdowns from Sex Workers and Stakeholders

7.2.1 The View of Sex Workers

In the interviews, some sex workers and stakeholders like EE owners held negative opinions on the anti-porn campaign. They thought the campaign was unnecessary, vicious and inhumane. For example:

I feel that this anti-porn campaign is a little unnecessary. This kind of thing is based on consensus, why would they want to control so much? It's not stealing or robbery! (Clubhouse technician, MB, Tianjin).

We MBs have survived in this way. Not every MB likes this job, some do it because of family financial problems, and their parents need money to treat illnesses. The anti-porn campaign is a problem for them. However, for the whole of society, it is to rectify social morality, and improving spiritual civilization is beneficial (MB, Yiheng, Shenyang).

The anti-porn campaign is useful for the whole society. We MBs do this to earn money. I know it's not a good industry, but if I didn't enter it, we wouldn't know what we were going to do, and no one would tell us what to do. So I hope the government will give job-seekers some clear instructions, give us another career (MB, Acheng, Shenyang).

7.2.2 The View of EE Owners and Managers



'Proper crackdown helps with the development of a harmonious society, but it's bad if the crackdown goes too far, the effect would be opposite' (Owner of MB clubhouse/KTV, Laobai, Shenyang). 'The shutting down or not [of clubs] won't affect disease prevention. Even if they closed, those who wanted to do this job would continue doing it. If you didn't close, he would also do it. It can't be controlled' (Manager Xu of KTV, MSM, Shenyang). 'We don't increase domestic demand, but we have solved many employment problems, solved business negotiations, and solved girls' employment. Even college graduates have difficulty finding a job. These girls don't have a high education, or would you rather they steal or rob? People need to earn their own living' (EE owner, Yezi, female, Qingdao).

In the meantime, some EE owners and MB held interesting attitudes about the anti-porn campaign. On the one hand, they understood the rationale behind the anti-porn campaign; on the other hand, they argued that the industry gives them a way out, and search for reasons to do the business legally.

What we are doing is not decent, and many people look down on us. We can understand the government's anti-porn campaign. Although we have some thoughts, the government also has its own task, and that's what they should do. It will be better after the Asian Games. Closing our establishments didn't help HIV/AIDS and STI prevention. I still hope for looser controls, to let female sex workers/xiaomei make a little money (EE owner, female, Guangzhou).

7.3 Commens and Suggestions from Sex Workers and Stakeholders

7.3.1 Suggestions from Sex Workers

Sex workers' main suggestions include: "stop the crackdown", "reduce social discrimination", and "forbid police baiting as law enforcement".

Stop the crackdowns. Even fines are better.

Implement a management fee system: submit 300-500 yuan each month, calculated by the area and number of people, per capita fee. Arrest the clients, but not female sex workers.

Most of our clients are migrant workers and old people. They are also victims of the crackdown. Don't arrest the disadvantaged groups in the beauty parlor/falang, on the street, in the roadside establishment; we have no backstage supporter. We don't have it easy. I hope society does not discriminate against us. Even after our arrest, don't beat us, don't use physical punishment to extort a confession, and don't send us to the re-education camps (Beauty Parlor girl/ falang xiaojie, peer educator, Qingdao).

I think for real, to have a physical examination and do the business with a certificate is relatively good, I agree with it. Because this kind of thing is decent. You say, so many people in the world, you can't limit everybody not to be a prostitute. If s/he didn't do sex service, what could s/he live on? The society would also riot. It's just people's need with society's development, right? This kind of thing (prostitution) is very normal (Transgender, Xiaobai, Kunming).

The police are unreasonable. Only what he says has to be the truth. Even if you don't have a condom, he finds other things to say. The CDC and you (CSWONF) had better give us a name card, saying we are volunteers. Then we wouldn't be afraid when the police come, aha. About the impact, there must be some, the business is

not good, some new kids left very quickly, who knows if they had diseases. If the strict crackdown goes on, the clubhouse will be more hidden. No suggestions; just don't always bait (MB, Beijing).

7.3.2 Suggestions from Community-based Sex Workers Service Organizations

I think the strict crackdown just let sex workers 'disappear' on the surface, but actually many sex workers would turn to underground work. The strict crackdown's influence on HIV/AIDS prevention is especially severe. In addition, some criminals will threaten sex workers' personal safety because of the crackdowns. I think we should cancel the crackdown trends, but have better management of sex workers (Tony Zheng, Shanghai Xinsheng).

Don't use condoms as evidence of prostitution. Promote condom use. Reduce the punishment if catching someone using condoms during prostitution.

To sum up, suggestions from some responding directors of CSWONF membership organizations are as follows:

- 1) Increase trainings for media. During this year's strict crackdown and anti-porn campaigns in the past, the media "stigmatized" reports on sex workers, which not only made sex workers more hidden, but also increased social discrimination (stigma). It is also one of the reasons that sex workers are "underground", which makes HIV/AIDS prevention and intervention for sex workers even more difficult. Therefore, it is suggested that international organizations, grassroot organizations work with the media to discuss how to better report through the media, to explore the more effective strategy for health and safety management and intervention for sex workers.
- 2) Increase coordination between the Department of Health Management and Department of Public Security. The research reveals that there is no member from the Health Department in the multi-departmental "anti-pornography office" of China. This will certainly influence the coordination between Department of Health Management and Department of Public Security on the "anti-pornography" affairs. In addition, there is no specific policy and document about "whether condom is evidence of prostitution". Therefore, more discussion on occupational safety of sex workers should be conducted either at the international or domestic level.
- 3) Effective legal aid for sex workers are needed by relevant legal aid agencies and civil society groups.
- 4) CSWONF increases its health promotion. Advocacy and trainings should be increased to government level, including "forbidding using condoms as evidence", "reducing anti-pornography", "sunshine law enforcement". Team leaders among sex workers in HIV prevention should be involved in these activities so that they can understand the role of sex industry to the stability of society.

8. Acknowledgements

This report was written by Ms. Cai Lingping. All data was collected and input by the members of CSWONF.

Thanks to UNFPA's funding and technical support; thanks to the assistance and efforts of the 14 CSWONF member organizations who conducted data collection and data entry. The 14 organizations are: Shanghai Xinsheng (originally Shanghai Leyi), Qingdao You and Me /Niwo, Jiaozhou Aixin, Shenyang Love's Support /Aizhiyuanzhu, Beijing Tongxing, Beijing Love without Border /Aixin Wuguojie, Wuhan Feminism Workroom /Nvquan Gongzuoshi, Jiangyou Caring Home, Sichuan Yunnan Parallel, Gejiu Phoenix /Kucao, Guangzhou Jin'guang, Tianjin Shenlan, Tianjin Xin'ai, Ruili Women and Children's Center /Fu'nv Er'tong Zhongxin.

The Secretariat of CSWONF conducted coordination of the research and data sorting.

UNFPA provided financial and technical support for the research.

UNAIDS provided technical assistance for the questionnaire design and report writing.

We would like to express our sincere thanks to the above organizations.

Special thanks also go to the respondents of this research, for their great support and cooperation.



